IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA ROANOKE DIVISION

CHARLES DAVID KING, JR.,)
Plaintiff,))) CIVIL ACTION
v.) FILE NO.: CL14000127-00
BLACKPOWDER PRODUCTS,)
INC.,))
and)
WAL-MART STORES EAST, LP,)

DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR SANCTIONS FOR SPOLIATION OF EVIDENCE

COME NOW, Defendants Blackpowder Products, Inc. ("BPI") and Wal-Mart Stores East, LP ("Wal-Mart") (collectively "Defendants"), by and through undersigned counsel, and move for sanctions against Plaintiff for spoliation of evidence.

Spoliation is the destruction or material alteration of evidence or the failure to preserve evidence in pending or reasonably foreseeable litigation. *Silvestri v. Gen. Motors Corp.*, 271 F.3d 583, 590 (4th Cir. 2001). Federal law recognizes that a party should not benefit from conduct that creates an inherent unfairness in access to evidence. *Id.* at 593; *Trigon Ins. Co v. U.S.*, 204 F.R.D. 277, 284 (E.D.Va. 2001). Depending on the severity of the prejudice, sanctions for

spoliation include dismissing the case, excluding expert testimony, or giving an adverse inference jury charge. *Silvestri*, 271 F.3d at 593; *Trigon Ins. Co*, 204 F.R.D. at 285; *Vodusek v. Bayliner Marine Corp.*, 71 F.3d 148, 156 (4th Cir. 1995).

Plaintiff has so spoliated the most relevant evidence in the case that it has significantly prejudiced Defendants' defense. The gun does not exist in the same condition as it did post-incident. A bullet that was lodged in the barrel post-incident was removed and subsequently lost, the gun was disassembled, the barrel where it ruptured had pieces broken off post-incident, and the powder and bullets purportedly used at the time of the incident, as well as a portion of the ramrod, were lost, all prior to the physical evidence being provided to Defendants. Respectfully, dismissal is warranted, or alternatively that Plaintiff's expert should be excluded. But, at a minimum, Defendants are entitled to an adverse inference jury charge that each piece of altered, lost, or destroyed evidence would have been unfavorable to Plaintiff's case.

This 16th day of May, 2016.

/s/ James E. Singer

JAMES E. SINGER

(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

BOVIS, KYLE, BURCH & MEDLIN, LLC

200 Ashford Center North, Suite 00

Atlanta, GA 30338-2668

Telephone: (770) 391-9100

Facsimile: (770) 668-0878

jes@boviskyle.com

and

WALTER H. PEAKE, III Virginia Bar No. 26379 FRITH, ANDERSON & PEAKE, P.C. 29 Franklin Rd., S.W. Roanoke, VA 24011

Telephone: (540) 725-3362 Facsimile: (540) 772-9167 wpeake@faplawfirm.com

Attorneys for Defendants Blackpowder Products, Inc. and Wal-Mart Stores East, LP

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify the foregoing *Defendants' Motion for Sanctions for Spoliation of Evidence* has been served on all counsel via e-mail using the CM/ECF filing system, which will send notification of such filing to the following attorneys of record:

Joseph H. McGrady, Esq.
McGrady & McGrady
127 Mill Street
Hillsville, VA 24343
joseph@mcgradylaw.com

Timothy E. Kirtner, Esq.
Gilmer, Sadler, Ingram, Sutherland & Hutton
P. O. Box 878
Pulaski, VA 24301
tkirtner@gsish.com

This 16th day of May, 2016.

/s/ James E. Singer_

JAMES E. SINGER (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*) BOVIS, KYLE, BURCH & MEDLIN, LLC

200 Ashford Center North, Suite 500 Atlanta, GA 30338-2668 Telephone: (770) 391-9100

Facsimile: (770) 668-0878

jes@boviskyle.com

One of the Attorneys for Defendants Blackpowder Products, Inc., and Wal-Mart Stores East, LP